Clarification of Queries raised in Pre-Bid Meeting for BDA PMU RFP

(Ref. RFP No. 7553, Dt. 08.03.2019)

The Request for Proposal (RFP) for Selection of Consultant firm for setting up of Project Monitoring Unit at Bhubaneswar Development Authority was issued on 26th July 2017. The Pre-Bid Meeting was held on 8th March 2019. The following queries were raised during the pre-bid meeting. BDA's reply/modifications/clarifications in response to the queries are tabulated below:

SI. No.	Suggestion/ Remarks/Clarification	Reference and Page No.	As per Existing RFP	BDA Response to the Queries/ Modification/Clarification
1.	We wish to submit that unlike other matured infrastructure sectors, government reforms in urban sector started with launch of JNNURM in 2005. The duration of any government programme in urban sector has not been more than 5 years. There are only a handful of such large programme/project management unit being tendered out and awarded. In view of this, keeping this condition may prohibit adequate competition. It is therefore requested that the same may be modified, as under, to facilitate adequate competition and better services to BDA b) The Applicant should have experience of successfully managing 5 Project Monitoring Unit/ Programme Management Unit in any government agency in India for a period of at least 3 years preferably in Urban Sector.	Section B, Clause 2.b); Page 1	As per the clause, the minimum eligibility criteria for bidders is as follows b) The Applicant should have experience of successfully managing a Project Monitoring Unit in any government agency in India for a period of at least 5 years preferably in Urban Sector	Revised RFP clause may be referred.

	Or			
	The Applicant should have experience of successfully managing a large project / setting up of Project Monitoring Unit in any government agency/private organization."			
2.	We wish to submit that there are many large and reputed firms in India and abroad which have offices in other parts of the India and also have been working in Odisha for many years. However, lack of Odisha GST registration certificate in Odisha does not hamper or affect quality of services. We believe that this condition is prohibitive in nature and would severely hamper the level and nature of participation for this bid. We, therefore, request you to kindly delete this clause to enable wider participation	Clause 9.1.c; Section B	As per the existing conditions of the RFP, a bidder is required to submit GST registration certificate of Odisha	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
3.	Bidder should have experience of successfully managing 5 Project Monitoring Unit/Programme Management Unit in any government agency in India for a period of at least 3 years preferably in Urban Sector. For evaluation purpose, following may be adopted Upto 5 projects – 5 marks 1 marks for each additional project	Table 1, Clause 15; Section B	Bidder should have experience of working as a PMU consultant for at least 5 years for a govt. body/authority during the last 10(Ten) years. For evaluation purpose, following may be adopted • For successfully managing up to 1 PMU – 5 marks • For successfully managing more than 1 PMU – 10 marks	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.

4.	Though the criteria is quite encouraging, it put consultants who has 9 projects meeting qualifying criteria equivalent to the one having 5 projects meeting qualifying criteria. To provide due benefit for success, it may be modified as follows: • Upto 5 projects – 5 marks • 1 marks for each additional project	Table 1, Clause 15; Section B	Experience of Successfully completing (including signing of concession agreement) PPP transactions: • For successfully completing 5 PPP transactions – 5 marks • For successfully completing 10 PPP transactions – 10 marks	Revised RFP Clause may be referred
5.	For a more objective assessment, we request that the scoring on presentation be limited to 20 marks. The Authority may consider allocating the remaining 15 marks to the experience and turnover of the firm.	Table 1, Clause 15; Section B	Presentation – Approach of the proposed unit along with work plan based on the terms of reference highlighting the job responsibility of each team member. The bidders shall be invited for a Power Point presentation in front of the committee to be formed by BDA to evaluate the presentation. 35 marks have been allocated towards presentation.	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document. (Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)

6.	Based on our evaluation of similar tenders tendered out by other agencies of India and Odisha, the minimum qualifying criteriashould always be equivalent to weightage given to technical score. Since in this case, it is 80:20 bid, we request you to kindly increase the qualifying marks to 80. Otherwise, request to consider 70:30.	Point 2.c; Clause 15; Section B	For each Technical Proposal, the total points that can be awarded for each Bidder are 100, and the minimum technical score (St) that a Bidder requires to qualify for evaluation of the Financial Proposal is 60 .	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
7.	We wish to submit that unlike other specialized work, there is no particular education qualification, which teaches PPP projects. Hence, it is requested that the same may be relaxed so that people from other background but relevant skills may also be able to participate. Moreover, successful closure of PPP projects depends on various things, which are beyond the control of a consultant. Given that there are only a handful of PPP projects in urban space which has been closed till now, it is requested that the same may be relaxed. Implementation of PPP projects is managed by independent engineer and not by a PPP expert. Post-construction activities is managed by PPP player with negligible contribution by a consultant. It is, therefore, suggested that keeping this condition may not serve the desired purpose and thus maybe deleted. Lastly, PMP/MRICs is required where experts are expected to monitor development of project. It has little contribution in PPP projects. Therefore,	Teaming; Page No 15	As per existing condition: 'Project Management-cum- PPP Expert' must be a BE/B.Tech with MBA/ MBA/PGDM /Post Graduation in Infrastructure or Construction Management from a reputed college/university. At least 6 years of relevant experience in the field of Urban Infrastructure / Urban Planning / PPP projects out of which at least 3 years of experience in handling and successful closure of PPP projects in a reputed organization. S/he should have experience of consulting / implementing at least 2 PPP projects in government sector. PMP/MRICS certification would be an added advantage.	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.

	the same may be deleted.			
8.	Given that there is no specialized educational stream in any of these activity, such domain expertise are picked up by an expert based on experience gained by working in the field over period of time. In view of this, it is submitted that the same may be relaxed and any post-graduation degree may be considered	Teaming; Page No 16	As per the existing conditions, the education qualification of Finance/Procurement Associate needs to be Masters in commerce/finance/MBA And PPP Associate needs to be Masters in commerce/finance/MBA	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
9.	Request you to kindly extend the due date by at least 2 weeks to allow comprehensive submission. Further it is also requested to allow submission of bid through hand delivery	General	Due date	The last date of submission of proposal has been extended till 30 th April'19.
10.	As it can be envisaged that BDA wants to have large and relevant players, we request for the following: Since it is a PMU, request turnover should be from Consulting only and not from sector like Infrastructure development, IT Hardware Supply etc. Further the Turnover Amount mentioned in Eligibility criteria is extremely high making it restrictive for major Consulting firms also to join.	Clause 2.a), Section B Page No. 1	The annual average turnover of the Applicant in India in the last five financial years ending 31 March 2018; shall be minimum INR 500 .00 Crores or above	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.

	It is requested that the criteria may be amended to read as: "The annual average turnover of the Applicant in India from Consulting in the last five financial years ending 31 March 2018; shall be minimum INR 300 .00 Crores or above Or The Global annual average turnover of the Applicant in the last three financial years ending 31 March 2018; shall be minimum INR 500.00 Crores or above."			
11.	We believe that PPP in Aviation, Ports, Tourism and Highways is also an integral part in urban sector as they constitute a major part of Urban Infrastructure. Request your clarification. Further, It would be also relevant to include PPP projects in Urban as well as non-Urban Sector as part of eligibility criteria.	Clause 2.c); Section B, Page 1	The Applicant should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory of at least 5 PPP Projects for a government body/ULB in the urban sector.	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
12.	It is requested that the marking criteria may be made in line to the above request of Eligibility Criteria and the maximum marks is kept at INR 500+ Cr.	Clause 15.1; Section B, Page 5	FINANCIAL CAPACITY OF BIDDER	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
13.	We request you to consider our request of considering Ongoing project or projects with at least 3 years	Clause 15.2; Section B, Page 5	The Bidder should have the experience of working as PMU Consultant for at least 5 years for a government body/ authority during last 10 (Ten) years	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
14.	Request you to kindly consider maximum marks for 5 Transactions instead of 10 PPP transactions as mentioned in the RFP document	Clause 15.3; Section B, Page 5	Experience Of Successfully Completing (including signing of concession agreement) PPP TRANSACTIONS	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.

15.	It is requested that the criteria may be amended to read as: "The Quoted Fee per month shall be paid by BDA within a time period of 30 days subject to the fulfilment of conditions in this RFP / Agreement by the selected bidder".	Clause 7.b); Page 3	The Quoted Fee per month shall be paid by BDA subject to the fulfilment of conditions in this RFP / Agreement by the selected bidder.	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.(Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)
16.	Please clarify if we need State specific GST Registration Certificate.	Clause 9.1(c); Page 3	Photocopy of the GST Registration Certificate in Odisha	Please refer point 2 on the response to clarifications
17.	It is requested that a suitable addition may be made in Form C to detail out the past experience of the Applicant by indicating the minimum number of work orders / value of work / service areas / location (domestic / international) to adequately reflect the expertise and acumen to undertake the assignment	Clause 9.1(f); Page 3	Past experience of the Applicant in Form-C. (Attach photo copies of work orders along with work completion certificate. In cases, where the work completion certificates for the services are not available, requisite documents to justify the basic eligibility criteria has to be submitted)	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
18.	It is requested that the clause may be amended to read as: "Either party can terminate the agreement by giving 30 days prior written notice, after adopting a due process of redressal and feedback mechanism within a mutually stipulated time frame".	Clause 18(b); Page 7	Either party can terminate the agreement by giving 30 days prior written notice	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.(Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)
19.	It is requested that the clause may be amended to read as: The DPR shall be prepared within the period / duration as may be instructed by the Bhubaneswar Development Authority and / mutually decided with PMU	Clause 4; Page 9	The DPR shall be prepared within the period / duration as may be instructed by the Bhubaneswar Development Authority.	DPR preparation has been removed from the scope of work. Please refer the revised RFP document.

20.	It is requested that the clause may be amended to read as:		Clause 4; Page 9	The above fee shall be paid as per the following deliverables:		aid as per the		
	Sl.No.	Description	% of total fee payable for a specific assignment	rage 9	Sl.No.	Description	% of total fee payable for a specific assignment	Not applicable since the DPR
	1 2	On award of assignment On submission of Draft	20% 50%		1	On award of assignment	20%	preparation has been removed from the scope of
	3	DPR On submission of the	20%		2	On submission of	30%	work.
	3	Final DPR incorporating the comments received	20%		3	Draft DPR 3 On submission of the Final DPR	30%	Please refer the revised RFP document.
	4	On approval of Final DPR	10%			incorporating the comments received		
					4	On approval of Final DPR	20%	
21.	It is requested that the clause may be amended to read as: The DPR shall be prepared within the period / duration as may be instructed by the Bhubaneswar Development Authority and / mutually decided with PMU		Clause 4; Page 10	the pe	rvices shall be pro riod / duration as ted by the Bhuba pment Authority	may be	DPR preparation has been removed from the scope of work. Please refer the revised RFP document.	
22.	,		Clause 4(3 rd bullet point); Page 10	project prepar Develo include	Bid Process Manages where DPR has ed by Bhubanesw pment Authority/e bid process manage of agreement witctor.	already been var 'State ULB's agement up to	Not applicable, since the scope of work has been revised. Please refer the revised RFP document.	

23.	Reference the scope of work at SI.3, pg. 8, it is requested that two additional associates be added to the full time on-site team: 2.d Urban Planner 2.e Social Development Expert Please clarify on the same Further we request one Environment Assessment Expert (may be with intermittent inputs) as it would be essential to undertake environment impact assessment of proposed projects	Clause 4; Page 11	Associates –The Expert team would be assisted by following 3 Associates. a. Engineering Works Associate b. Finance /Procurement Associate c. PPP Associate	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.(Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)
24.	It is requested that the requirement of Minimum Qualification and Experience for the position of Team Leader be amended to read as: "Masters in Planning / Infrastructure Management / Bachelor in Engineering with MBA/PGDM from a reputed college/ university.	Clause 4; Page 12	Position: Team Leader Minimum Qualification and Experience: MBA/PGDM from a reputed college/university	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.
	At least 8 years of relevant experience in the field of Urban Infrastructure/Urban Planning/PPP projects out of which at least2 years of experience as Team Leader in reputed organization(s)			
25.	Request to keep Annual Escalation of 10% instead of freezing it for 3 year.	Clause 6; Page 14	Contract period On satisfactory performance during the contract period and at the sole discretion of the Authority, there will be a one-time escalation of 10% in monthly retainer-ship fees which shall	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.(Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)

26.	Under this clause, it is requested that clarification be provided on the following: (i) Description of tasks and payment milestone against each task for preparation of DPR or will the terms be as defined under Section C 4, pages 9 and 10? (ii) The modalities of calculation and payment stages against the success fee (iii) Is the success fee applicable for all projects for which DPR has been prepared like O&M, PPP, EPC etc.	Clause 7; Page 14	be valid for the next three years (37-72 months). The agreement can be renewed after 36 months on mutually agreed terms and conditions. Preparation of DPRs: The selected bidder may also be asked to carry out preparation of Detail Project Report for other Govt. entities as and when required through due consent by Bhubaneswar Development Authority (BDA). For Projects involving preparation of DPR by other Development/ City Authorities in Odisha - the success fee shall be shared equally between BDA & the selected firm.	Not applicable since the scope of work has been revised. Please refer the revised RFP document.
27.	As per a general observation PPP projects typically exhibit long execution periods due to phase wise developments and have a comparatively low success rate. Thereby we request the authority to kindly lower the number of required PPP projects for maximum marks and allow ongoing projects where partial completion certificates from the client are available	Clause 15, Table 1, Point 3, Page 5	EXPERIENCE OF SUCCESSFULLY COMPLETING (including signing of concession agreement) PPP TRANSACTIONS"	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
28.	We request the authority to kindly mention the number of core team members to be deployed at BDA.		Deployment of Key Personnel	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.

29.	We wish to state that the clause limits the ability and expertise of the Key personnel to be deployed as a "Finance cum Procurement Expert". Experts with top expertise are available in the industry, however they necessarily would not have worked in the government sector previously. We thereby request the Authority to kindly remove the clause for the experience of the personnel in the government sector.	Point 3 - Finance cum Procurement Expert, point b., Page 12	At least 6 years of relevant experience in total of which at least 3 years in government sector.	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document(Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)
30.	We request the authority to kindly change the clause as below: The number of points to be assigned to each of the experts shall be determined considering the following sub-criteria and relevant percentage weights: a)Minimum qualifications (Fulfilling minimum education criteria mentioned in the ToR): 30% b) Minimum Experience (Fulfilling Minimum Years' of relevant experience criteria as mentioned in the ToR): 30% c) Relevant Sector Experience (Fulfilling experience criteria of relevant sector and assignment as mentioned in the ToR): 40%	Clause 15 - Bid Evaluation Methodology, Page 5	The number of points to be assigned to each of the experts shall be determined considering the following sub-criteria and relevant percentage weights: a) Minimum qualifications (Fulfilling minimum education criteria mentioned in the ToR): 20% b) Minimum Experience (Fulfilling Minimum Years' of relevant experience criteria as mentioned in the ToR): 30% c) Relevant Sector Experience (Fulfilling experience criteria of relevant sector and assignment as mentioned in the ToR): 50%	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.(Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)
31.	We request the authority to kindly elaborate the scope of work.	Terms of Reference – Clause 3. Scope of	The scope of work for the Project Monitoring Unit shall include advisory support and assistance in the following major areas which shall include, but	Please refer the scope of work of revised RFP document.

		Work	not limited to:	
			1. Project Management, Monitoring	
			and Reviewing	
			2. Transaction Advisory services for	
			PPP projects	
			3. Preparation of DPR's, which will be	
			delivered by back office of the firm	
			deploying the PMU	
			4. Drafting of Regulations & Policies	
			5. Procurement works	
			(RFP's/EoI/RFQ's) of different divisions	
			of BDA	
			6. Capacity Building towards Govt.	
22	NA/a manusat tha authority to bigdly associated the	Classes 2	Agencies	Daviss d DED Clause asset ha
32.	We request the authority to kindly consider the	Clause 2 –	The bidder (company incorporated	Revised RFP Clause may be
	following change:	Minimum	under the Companies Act or a limited	referred.
	The bidder (company incorporated under the	Eligibility	liability partnership registered in India),	
	Companies Act or a limited liability partnership	Criteria, Page	which meets the Eligibility Criteria as	
	registered in India), which meets the Eligibility	1	specified below as on the last date of	
	Criteria as specified below as on the last date of		submission of the RFP shall be eligible to submit the proposal: -	
	submission of the RFP shall be eligible to submit the proposal: -		to subtrite the proposal	
	a) The annual average turnover of the Applicant		a) The annual average turnover of the	
	in India in the last five financial years ending 31		Applicant in India in the last five	
	March 2018; shall be minimum INR 500 .00		financial years ending 31 March 2018;	
	Crores or above.		shall be minimum INR 500 .00 Crores	
	Crores of above.		or above.	
	b) The Applicant should have experience of		0. 45010.	
	successfully managing a Project Monitoring Unit		b) The Applicant should have	
	in any government agency in India for a period of		experience of successfully managing a	

	at least 2 years preferably. c) The Applicant should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory of at least 5 PPP Projects for a government body/ULB in the urban sector.		Project Monitoring Unit in any government agency in India for a period of at least 5 years preferably in Urban Sector. c) The Applicant should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory of at least 5 PPP Projects for a government body/ULB in the urban sector.	
33.	As per the minimum eligibility criteria of the RfP, annual turnover for last five financial year needs to be provided while Form C of the RfP mentions a turnover requirement for last three financial years. Kindly clarify if we need to provide audited financial statements for three or five years.	Section B; Clause 2 (a); Page 1 Form C; Point 9	Minimum Eligibility Criteria (Annual turnover) - The annual turnover of the Applicant in India in the last five financial years ending March 31, 2018; shall be minimum INR 500 Crores or above Average annual turnover of the Applicant (in INR) during the last three financial years ending 31st March 2018. (Please attach copy of three audited financial statements)	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.
34.	We request BDA to allow self-certification for works completed.	Section B; Clause 9; Point 1 (f); Page 3	Documents accompanying the Proposal Past experience of the Applicant in Form- C (Attach photo copies of work orders along with work completion certificate. In case, where work completion certificates for the services are not available, requisite documents to justify the basic	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.

			eligibilit	y criteria has t	o be submitted.	
35.	We understand that in addition to DPR preparation for other government entities, the selected bidder may also be required to prepare bid documents and conduct bid evaluation for other Government entities. Also, for both the cases, payment would be made over and above the fee quoted by the selected bidder during the bidding stage. Kindly confirm if our understanding is true.	Section C; Clause 4; Point iii. ;Page 10	Governr		PR is prepared by which it will be nanner Professional Fees (as of estimated project cost and applicable service tax) 0.5% (to a maximum of Rs.10 lakhs) 0.33% (to a maximum of Rs.15 lakhs) 0.25% (to a maximum of Rs.20 lakhs) 0.30% (to a maximum of Rs.20 lakhs)	Not applicable since the scope of work has been revised. Please refer the revised RFP document.

36.	We understand that selected bidder may be required to prepare DPR for other Govt. entities as and when required. However, the payment scheduled mentioned in the table in Clause 4 on Page 9 of the RfP, does not mention specifically the payment milestone for DPR preparation work that the selected bidder may be required to do for other Govt. entities. Kindly clarify the same.	Section C; Clause 7; Page 14	Preparation of DPR's: The selected bidder may be asked to carry out preparation of Detail Project Report for other Govt. entities as and when required through due consent by Bhubaneswar Development Authority (BDA) For Projects involving preparation of DPR by other Development/City Authorities in Odisha – the success fee shall be shared equally between BDA & the selected firm	Not applicable since the scope of work has been revised. Please refer the revised RFP document.
37.	We suggest the following change in the minimum qualification and experience requirement for Project Management cum PPP Expert O B.E/B.Tech/B.Arch with MBA/PGDM/Master's Degree in Infrastructure Planning/Infrastructure Management/Finance from a reputed college/university O At least 6 years of relevant experience in the field of Urban Infrastructure/Urban Planning/PPP projects out of which at least 3 years of experience in handling and successful closure of PPP projects in a reputed organization. O S/he should have experience of consulting/implementing at least 2 PPP projects in government sector.	Section C; Table; Page 12	Project Management cum PPP Expert o B.E/B.Tech with MBA/PGDM/Post Graduation in Infrastructure or Construction Management from a reputed college/university o At least 6 years of relevant experience in the field of Urban Infrastructure/Urban Planning/PPP projects out of which at least 3 years of experience in handling and successful closure of PPP projects in a reputed organization. o S/he should have experience of consulting/implementing at least 2 PPP projects in government sector.	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.

			o PMP/MRCIS certification would be an added advantage	
38.	i) BDA may terminate this Agreement, or any particular Services, immediately upon written notice to BDA if the Consultant reasonably determines that it can no longer provide the Services in accordance with applicable law or professional obligations.	General	Additional Clauses	Please refer the relevant section of the revised RFP document.(Provisions of the original RFP remains unchanged)
	ii) BDA shall not recover from the Consultant, in contract or tort, under statute or otherwise, any amount with respect to loss of profit, data or goodwill, or any other consequential, incidental, indirect, punitive or special damages in connection with claims arising out of this Agreement or otherwise relating to the Services, whether or not the likelihood of such loss or damage was contemplated."			
39.	Request you to consider changing the criteria to - "The Applicant should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory/Due Diligence of at least 5 projects for a government body/ULB/Private organization."	Minimum Eligibility Criteria: Page 4	The Applicant should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory of at least 5 PPP Projects for a government body/ULB in the urban sector.	Revised RFP Clause may be referred.

40.	Request you to consider changing the criteria to	Bid	Bidder's Average Annual Turnover for	Revised RFP Clause may be
	_	Evaluation	the last Five Financial Years (ending 31	referred.
	"Bidder's Average Annual Turnover for the last	Methodology:	March 2018) has to be at least INR 500	
	Three Financial Years (ending 31 March 2018)	Page 8	Crores	
	has to be at least INR 50 Crores	_	• For INR 500–INR 750 crores – 5	
	• For INR 50–INR 60 crores – 5 marks		marks	
	• For INR 60 – INR 70 crores – 10 marks		• For INR 750 – INR 1000 crores –10	
	• Above INR 70 crores – 15 marks."		marks	
	OR		• Above INR 1000 crores – 15 marks	
	Please allow Global revenue of network firms for			
	qualification and evaluation.			
41.	Request you to consider changing the criteria to	Bid	The Bidder should have the experience	Revised RFP Clause may be
	_	Evaluation	of working as PMU Consultant for at	referred.
	"The Bidder should have the experience of	Methodology:	least 5 years for a government	
	Project management/Program Management for	Page 8	body/authority during last 10 (Ten)	
	government body/authority/Private Organization		years	
	• For successfully managing up to 1 PMU – 5		 For successfully managing up to 1 	
	marks		PMU–5 Marks	
	 For successfully managing more than 1 PMU – 		For successfully managing more than	
	10 marks"		1 PMU–10 marks	
42.	Request you to consider changing the criteria to	Bid	Experience of successfully completing	Revised RFP Clause may be
	_	Evaluation	(including signing of concession	referred.
	"Experience of successfully completing (including	Methodology:	agreement) PPP transactions	
	signing of concession agreement) transactions	Page 8	For successfully completing 5 PPP	
	• For successfully completing 5 Transactions/due		Transactions – 5 marks	
	diligence – 5 marks		• For successfully completing 10 PPP	
	For successfully completing 10		Transactions – 10 marks	
	Transactions/due diligence – 10 marks"			